

Menachos – Simanim

פרק יג – הרי עלי עשרון

דף קט – Daf 109

1. A *Korban* to bring a *korban* in בית חוניו

The next Mishnah states that one who vows to bring a *korban* must bring it in the Beis Hamikdash, and if he offered it in בית חוניו – *the Temple of Chonyo* in Alexandria, he is not יוצא. However, if he said הרי עלי שאקריבנה בבית חוניו – “It is upon me to bring an olah, to offer it in the Temple of Chonyo,” he still must offer it in the Beis Hamikdash, but if he offered it in בית חוניו, he is יוצא. Rebbe Shimon says אין זו עולה – *this animal is not an olah* at all, because the vow was illegitimate. The Gemara asks about the second case: היא מקטל קטלה – *he has merely killed* [the animal], i.e., sacrificing in בית חוניו it is not a valid offering at all!? Rav Hamnuna explains that his condition to “sacrifice” it in בית חוניו is tantamount to vowing אתחייב באחריותה – *on condition I am not responsible for replacing it if it dies,* since he has declared his intent to kill it. Rava explains differently: אדם זה לדורון נתכוין – *this man only intended to bring a gift*, not an actual *korban*, saying: אי סגיא בבית חוניו טרחנא – *“If it suffices to bring it in בית חוניו, I will bother to do so, but not more than that.”*

2. *Machlokes* about disqualifying a Kohen for four forms of idolatry

A *passuk* permanently disqualifies any Kohen who served idols from ever performing *avodah* in the Beis Hamikdash. Rav Nachman and Rav Sheishess argued about four different forms of idolatry: (1) שגג בזריקה – if [a Kohen] acted *mistakenly regarding throwing blood for avodah zarah*, Rav Nachman says: קרבנו ריח ניחוח – *his subsequent korban is a pleasing aroma* (i.e., accepted, after he repents), but Rav Sheishess says he is permanently disqualified. He holds the *passuk's* expression “למכשול עון” – *a stumbling, an iniquity* refers to two types of sin, מזיד and שוגג. (2) הזיד – if he acted *intentionally regarding shechitah* for idolatry, Rav Nachman says his subsequent *korbanos* are accepted, because the phrase “אשר ישרתו” – *because they served* [idols] implies that only שירות – *service* for idolatry disqualifies Kohanim, and *shechitah* is not שירות. Rav Sheishess says the Kohen is disqualified, because נעשה משרת – *he became an attendant of idolatry* (but would not for *shechting* כובעים). (3) If he bowed to an idol, or (4) הודה – *accepted an idol upon himself*, Rav Nachman says his *avodah* is valid after repenting, but Rav Sheishess says he is disqualified.

3. *Machlokes* if בית חוניו was idolatrous (the story of its origins, and the danger of prominence)

Tannaim debate if בית חוניו was a pagan temple: Shimon HaTzaddik instructed at his passing that his younger son חוניו should serve as Kohen Gadol after him. According to Rebbe Meir, his older brother שמעי was jealous, and tricked him into wearing feminine clothing to his inauguration, telling the Kohanim that חוניו had vowed to his wife to wear this clothing to his inauguration. The Kohanim sought to kill חוניו for the disgrace, and he fled to Alexandria, and built an idolatrous altar there. The Sages said: if שמעי, who had not even obtained prominence, still plotted his brother's death out of jealousy, וכמה – *one who actually obtains prominence, all the more so* will act destructively if removed! Rebbe Yehudah relates the story differently: חוניו declined the position, leaving it for his older brother שמעי. However, he changed his mind and plotted to have שמעי killed by having him dress in feminine clothing to his inauguration (the reverse of the above version). However, שמעי revealed חוניו's plot, and the Kohanim sought to kill חוניו, whereupon he fled to Alexandria and established a temple there, sacrificing שמים ליהוה. The Sages said: if חוניו, שברח ממנה – *who originally fled from* [prominence], eventually came to this tragic end, המבקש לירד – *then one who seeks to obtain prominence, all the more so!*

Siman - Kit (Hatzalah kit)

The Hatzalah member who grabbed his kit and ran to treat the man who cut his finger while *shechting* an עולה in בית חניו told a Kohen he found there doing בשוגג זריקה that he can no longer serve in the Beis Hamikdash and was mesmerized by the mural depicting the story of how בית חוניו got started.



The **Hatzolah member** who grabbed his **kit** and ran to treat the man who cut his finger while *shechting* an *עולה* in *בית חוניו* told a *Kohen* he found there doing *זריקה בשוגג* that he can no longer serve in the *Beis Hamikdash* and was mesmerized by the mural depicting the story of how *בית חוניו* got started.

3 things to remember

1. A **נדר** to bring a *korban* in *בית חוניו*
2. *Machlokes* about disqualifying a *Kohen* from *עבודה* for four forms of idolatry
3. *Machlokes* if *בית חוניו* was idolatrous (its origins, and the danger of prominence)

